Contents

Preface xxv
Acknowledgments xxvii

PART ONE
THE EARLY RIGHT TO ARMS 1

1
Social Science 3

A. Challenges of Empirical Assessments of Firearms Policy 3
B. American Gun Ownership 8
  1. Gun Ownership by State 12
  2. Gun Ownership by Type 15
C. Defensive Gun Use: Frequency and Results 16
  2. The Frequency of Defensive Gun Use 18
     a. The National Crime Victimization Survey 18
     b. Assessment of the NCVS as a Measure of DGUs 18
     c. Kleck & Gertz Survey 18
     d. Other Surveys 21
D. Firearm Accidents 22
  1. Why Have Fatal Gun Accident Rates—including Rates for Children—Plunged? 23
E. Firearm Suicide 26
F. Firearm Violent Crime 27
  1. Homicides 27
  2. Aggravated Assaults and Robberies 29
G. How Do Criminals Obtain Guns? 29
H. Race, Gun Crime, and Victimization 34
I. Youth Crime 38
J. Recent Downward Trend of Violent Crime and Growth of the American Firearm Inventory
   2. Some Theories About the Cause of the Decline in Violent Crime 41

K. Does Gun Ownership Reduce Crime?
   1. Firearms Ownership as a Factor Reducing Home Invasion Burglary 43
   2. Studies of Criminals and Deterrence 45
   3. Real-World Experiments in Gun Possession as a Deterrent to Crime 46
   4. Police Response as a Factor in the Decision to Own a Firearm 47
   5. Lawful Defensive Carry of Firearms
      a. Crime Outside the Home 48
      b. Do Concealed-Carry Laws Affect the Crime Rate? 49

L. Does Gun Control Reduce Crime?
   1. The Argument for Disarming the Law-Abiding 53
   2. National Research Council Metastudy of Gun Control
      National Research Council, Firearms and Violence: A Critical Review 56

M. Mass Shootings
   1. Comparative Data 64
   2. Magazines
      Exercise: Shotguns as “Assault Weapons” 68
      Parks, Joint Service Combat Shotgun Program 69

Arms Rights, Arms Duties, and Arms Control in the United Kingdom 73

A. Anglo-Saxons, the Militia, and the Posse Comitatus 75
B. The Responsibility to Possess Arms
   Statute of Winchester 79
C. The Responsibility to Bear Arms: Hue and Cry, Watch and Ward, and the Posse Comitatus 80
D. The Codified Right to Resist Tyranny: Magna Carta
   Magna Carta 83
E. Castle Doctrine: Semayne’s Case 85
F. Arms Carrying
   1. The Statute of Northampton
      Statute of Northampton 91
   2. Developments in Laws About Bearing Arms 93
   3. Sir John Knight’s Case 95
   4. The Right to Carry Arms After 1686 98
   5. American Application of English Law on Carrying 99
   6. Laws Against Armed Public Assemblies 101
### G. Restrictive Licensing Attempted: The Tudors, Crossbows, and Handguns

1. Longbows and English Liberty 102
2. Henry VII and Henry VIII 104
3. Edward VI 108
4. Mary & Philip 108
5. Elizabeth I 109
   a. Handgun Control 109
   b. Elizabeth’s Militia 110
   c. Archery 111
   d. Elizabeth and Hunting 111

### H. Disarmament Rejected: The Glorious Revolution and the Bill of Rights

1. James I and Charles I: The First Stuarts 113
   a. Hunting 114
   b. Arms Restrictions 115
   c. Virginia and New England 115
   d. Gunpowder Monopoly, Saltpeter, and Urine Control 116
   e. The Militia 118
2. The British Civil Wars and the Interregnum 120
   a. Arms and Ideology During the Civil Wars 121
   b. Arms and Arms Laws of the Interregnum 123
3. Charles II and James II: Arms Prohibition and the Glorious Revolution 125
   a. The Game Act of 1671 125
   b. The Glorious Revolution 128
4. The Bill of Rights 131
5. Legislation and Litigation After the Bill of Rights 133
6. James Madison and Other Americans on the English Bill of Rights 136

### I. Arms Technology and Ownership in the United Kingdom

1. Matchlocks and Wheellocks 140
2. The Flintlock and the Brown Bess 141
3. The Blunderbuss and Other Handguns 142
4. Breechloaders and Repeaters 142
5. Firearms Prevalence 144

### J. The Eighteenth Century and Beyond

1. Scottish Highlanders 145
2. Ireland 149
3. The Gordon Riots 151
4. The Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries 155

### K. The Philosophy of Resistance

1. Blackstone 158
   Blackstone, *Commentaries on the Laws of England* 159
2. John Locke 160
   Locke, *Second Treatise of Government* 161
3. Algernon Sidney 162
4. Novanglus 164
   Adams, *Novanglus* 165
The Colonies and the Revolution

A. Arms Rights in Colonial Charters

B. Firearms Control in the Colonies

1. Early Arms Mandates
   a. Colonial Statutes Mandating Arms Possession
   b. Colonial Statutes Mandating Arms-Carrying
   c. Freedom Dues for Indentured Servants

2. Early Firearms Regulation and Prohibition
   a. Safety Regulations
   b. Limits on Gun Sales to Indians
   c. Gun Restrictions on Blacks
   d. Sporadic Disarmament of Dissidents

C. Personal and Collective Defense Ideology in Pre-Revolutionary America

1. The Boston Massacre Trial
2. The Colonial View of the English Right to Arms
   Adams, E.A., Boston Gazette, Feb. 27, 1769
3. Religion, Arms, and Resistance
   Mayhew, A Discourse Concerning Unlimited Submission and Non-Resistance to the Higher Powers: With Some Reflections on the Resistance Made to King Charles I and on the Anniversary of His Death (Jan. 30, 1750)
   Howard, A Sermon Preached to the Ancient and Honorable Artillery Company in Boston

D. Arms Technology, Tactics, and Culture in the Colonies

1. How Common Were Firearms in America?
2. American Arms
   a. Flintlocks
   b. The Pennsylvania-Kentucky Rifle
   c. Breech Loaders and Repeaters
   d. Edged Weapons
   e. Armor
   f. Production Issues
3. Colonial Militias and Temporary Armies
   a. Massachusetts
   b. Connecticut
   c. Plymouth
   d. New Hampshire and Maine
   e. Rhode Island
   f. Virginia
   g. South Carolina
4. American versus English Militias
5. Strengths and Weaknesses of the Colonial Militias
   a. Inter-Colony Cooperation
   b. Discipline
c. Officer Quality 238

d. Training 238

e. Arms Possession and Proficiency 238

6. A New Culture 239

E. The British Crackdown 240

1. America’s Glorious Revolution 240

2. The Anglo-American Alliance Against France in the Eighteenth Century 244

3. A Decade of Coercion, and then the Powder Alarm 246

4. Disarmament Orders from London 253

5. The Import Ban 253

6. Calls for Defiance: Patrick Henry and the South 256

   Henry, The War Inevitable, Speech at the Second Revolution ary Convention of Virginia 256

7. Defiance in Practice and the Independent Militias 259

F. Arms and the American Revolution 261

1. Gun Confiscation at Lexington and Concord 262

2. Gun Confiscation in Boston 264

3. Declaration of Causes and Necessity of Taking Up Arms 266

   The Declaration by the Representatives of the United Colonies of North America, July 6, 1775 267

4. Falmouth Destroyed 270

5. The Declaration of Independence 272

   The Declaration of Independence 272


7. Acquiring Arms and Ammunition in Wartime 277

8. Disarming the Enemy 279

9. The Militia, the Continental Army, and American Marksmanship 281

G. The Articles of Confederation 285

H. The Right to Arms, Standing Armies, and Militias in the Early State Constitutions and Statutes 287

1. South Carolina 287

2. Virginia 287

3. New Jersey 288

4. Pennsylvania 289

5. Delaware 290

6. Maryland 291

7. North Carolina 291

8. Georgia 291

9. New York 292

10. Vermont 293

11. Massachusetts 294

12. New Hampshire 295

13. Connecticut 296

14. Rhode Island 297
The New Constitution

A. Standing Armies, Militias, and Individual Rights —
   The Constitutional Convention of 1787 304
B. State Ratification Conventions 308
   1. Pennsylvania 309
   2. Massachusetts 311
   3. Maryland 312
   4. New Hampshire 314
   5. Virginia 314
      Virginia Ratification Message 321
      Resolution of Virginia’s Proposed Amendments 321
   6. New York 324
   7. North Carolina 326
      Resolution of North Carolina’s Proposed Amendments 326
   8. Rhode Island 327
      Rhode Island Ratification Message 328
C. Commentary During the Ratification Period 329
   1. The Federalist Papers 329
      The Federalist No. 29 (Alexander Hamilton) 329
      The Federalist No. 46 (James Madison) 329
   2. Tench Coxe 330
   3. Other Federalists 332
D. The Second Amendment 334
   1. The Second Amendment’s Path Through Congress 334
   2. Commentary on the Second Amendment 338
E. Arms Technology at the Time of the Second Amendment 346
F. Post-Ratification 347
   1. The Militia Acts 347
      First Militia Act of 1792 348
      Second Militia Act of 1792 349
   2. St. George Tucker 354
      a. Tucker’s Blackstone 354
      b. Tucker’s Early Lecture Notes 357

The Right to Arms, Militias, and Slavery in the Early Republic and Antebellum Periods 359

A. Militias as a Military and Political Force in the Post-Revolutionary Period 360
   1. The Crisis of 1798-99 360
      a. The Federalist Program 360
   2. The Kentucky and Virginia Resolutions 361
3. Fries’s Rebellion 362
4. The Crisis of 1800 363
5. Nullification and Interposition 366
6. The War of 1812 367
7. Texan Independence 369

B. Antebellum Case Law on the Right to Arms Under State and Federal Constitutions 371
1. A Right to Carry Weapons Openly for Self-Defense 373
   *Nunn v. State* 373
2. The “Civilized Warfare” Test: Militia Weapons Only? 382
   *Aymette v. State* 382
3. A “General Right of Sovereignty” Subject to Legislative Discretion? 389
4. The Use of Antebellum State Court Decisions to Interpret the Second Amendment 390

C. Changes in Arms Technology 392
1. Knife Controls 392
2. The Rise of the Machine Tools 394
   a. The Federal Armories 395
   b. The American System of Manufacture 397
3. Loading, Ignition, and Ammunition 399
   a. Mass Market Breechloaders 399
   b. Ignition 400
   c. Better Bullets 401
4. The Demand for Accuracy 401
5. Repeaters 401
   a. Repeating Handguns: Revolvers and Pepperboxes 402
   b. The Metallic Cartridge 402
   c. The Repeating Rifle 403
6. Conclusion 403

D. Weapons Control and Southern Culture 404

E. The Right to Arms and Slavery 406
1. Slavery in the Courts 408
   *State v. Newsom* 408
2. Slavery for Everyone: Fugitive Slaves and the *Posse Comitatus* 414

F. Antebellum Legal Commentary on the Right to Arms 415
1. William Rawle 415
2. Joseph Story 417
   a. The Second Amendment in Story’s *Commentaries* 417
   b. The Second Amendment in Story’s *Familiar Exposition* 418
   c. *Houston v. Moore* 419
The War, Reconstruction, and Beyond

A. Disarmament of Whites and Armament of Blacks
   B. The Initial Response to Black Freedom
      1. The Black Codes
         Florida, An Act Prescribing Additional Penalties for the Commission of Offenses Against the State and for Other Purposes
         Mississippi, An Act to Punish Certain Offences Therein Named, and for Other Purposes
         Landry Parish, Louisiana, Ordinance of 1865
      2. The Ku Klux Klan and Other Extralegal Suppression of Freedmen
   C. The Congressional Response: The Fourteenth Amendment, the Freedmen’s Bureau Acts, and the Civil Rights Act
      Thirteenth Amendment
      Civil Rights Act of 1866
      Second Freedmen’s Bureau Act
      Fourteenth Amendment
      United States v. Cruikshank
   D. Labor Agitation and the Repressive Response
      Presser v. Illinois
   E. Nineteenth-Century Commentary
      1. Chief Justice Thomas M. Cooley
         Cooley, A Treatise on the Constitutional Limitations Which Rest upon the Legislative Power of the States of the American Union
         Cooley, The General Principles of Constitutional Law in the United States of America
      2. Other Commentary
         Bishop, Commentaries on the Law of Statutory Crimes
         Bishop, Commentaries on the Law of Statutory Crimes (2d ed.)
   F. Technological and Cultural Changes
      1. Ammunition
         a. Smokeless Powder
         b. Jacketed Bullets
      2. Repeaters
      3. The Box Magazine
      4. Machine Guns and Automatics
      5. Manufacturing
      6. Changes in Hunting
      7. Target Shooting
      8. Shotgun Shooting
   G. Late Nineteenth-Century State Laws and Cases
      1. Tennessee
Andrews v. State
State v. Wilburn
2. Arkansas
3. Texas
   State v. Duke
4. Florida, Vigilantism, Lynching, and Winchester Repeaters
   a. Vigilantism
   b. Lynching
   c. Winchesters vs. Lynch Mobs
   d. Florida’s Statute on Handguns, Winchesters, and Repeaters
5. Kansas
   City of Salina v. Blaksley
H. State Constitutions at the Turn of the Century
I. The Self-Defense Cases

PART TWO
THE TWENTIETH CENTURY RIGHT TO ARMS

A New and Dangerous Century

A. Aliens
   Patsone v. Pennsylvania
   People v. Nakamura
B. Changes in the Militia, and Other Federal and State Military Forces
   1. The Organized Militia
      a. Nineteenth-Century Background
      b. The Original National Guard
      c. The Dick Act and the Modern National Guard
   2. The Unorganized Militia
      a. Early Federal Programs to Arm and Train the Militia
      b. Twentieth-Century Programs to Arm and Train the Militia
   3. Other Federal and State Military Forces
      a. The United States Armed Forces
      b. State Defense Forces
C. Changes in Arms Technology
   1. Manufacturing and Affordability
   2. Semi-Automatics
      a. Handguns
      b. Long Guns
   3. Silencers
   4. Machine Guns
   5. What Lay in the Future
D. New Federal and State Laws 523
   1. Social Background 523
   2. Concealed Carry 526
   3. The Uniform Firearms Act 526
   4. Laws on Semi-Automatics and Pump-Action Firearms 528
   6. Congressional Legislation for the District of Columbia 530
      Firearms Act 530
      National Firearms Act of 1934 533
      Federal Firearms Act of 1938 534
      Sonzinsky v. United States 536
      United States v. Miller 540
E. National Firearms Act Regulation Today 547
   1. NFA Arms 548
   2. The NFA Transfer Procedure 552
   3. Recent Growth in NFA Ownership 554
   4. Modern NFA Controversies 555
      Staples v. United States 556
      United States v. Thompson/Center Arms Company 567
F. Armed Citizens and the Second World War 573
   1. The United States 573
      a. The Property Requisition Act 573
      b. The Militia 574
      c. The Civilian Marksmanship Program 574
      d. The Arsenal of Democracy 575
      e. Rationing and Shortages on the Home Front 575
   2. The United Kingdom 576
   3. After the War 578
G. Individual and Collective Rights 580

Between *Miller* and *Heller*: The Second Amendment
and Gun Regulation in the Modern Era 583

A. Two Early and Pivotal Lower Court Interpretations of *Miller* 583
   *Cases v. United States* 584
   Johnson, Heller as Miller 586
   *United States v. Tot* 588
B. The Second Amendment in the Latter Twentieth Century 590
   2. Defining Terms Used in the Second Amendment 596
   3. Gun Control and the Limits of Federal Power 597
      *Printz v. United States* 599
C. Modern Federal Regulation of Firearms: The Gun Control
   Act of 1968, Its Amendments, and Administrative Regulations 606
   Firearms Regulation: A Summary 607
1. Felons and the Right to Arms 612
   *Lewis v. United States* 612
2. Regulation of Retail Sales of Ordinary Firearms 615
   a. Regulation of Buyers 616
      *National Rifle Ass’n of America Inc. v. Reno* 618
      *United States v. Moore* 624
   b. Regulation of Sellers 632
      *United States v. Biswell* 633
3. Private Sales, Loans, and Private Manufacturing: The Secondary Market and Gun Shows 634
   *SCOPE, Inc. v. Pataki* 634
   *Chow v. Maryland* 641
4. “Sporting Use” as a Marker of Legitimate Firearms 647
   *Gilbert Equip. Co. v. Higgins* 648
5. Policing Illegal Guns 656
   *Terry v. Ohio* 656
   Exercise: *Terry Stops and the Evolving Right to Keep and Bear Arms* 660
   *United States v. Williams* 661
6. Interstate Transportation of Firearms 664
   *Revell v. Port Authority of New York and New Jersey* 664
   *Torraco v. Port Authority of New York & New Jersey* 670
D. Suing the Gun Industry and the Legislative Response: The Protection of Lawful Commerce in Arms Act 678
   *City of New York v. Beretta U.S.A. Corp.* 680

**9**

**The Right to Arms in the States** 693
A. Modern State Constitutional Decisions 693
   *State v. Kessler* 694
   *Arnold v. City of Cleveland* 700
B. Recent Changes to State Constitutional Right to Arms Guarantees 710
   1. Louisiana 710
   2. Missouri 711
   3. Alabama 711
      *State in the Interest of J.M.* 712
C. State Firearms Preemption Laws 722
   *City of Cleveland v. State* 724
D. Modern State Gun Control Laws 731
   1. Purchasing a Gun 731
   2. Gun Registration 732
   3. Keeping a Gun at Home 732
   4. Target Shooting 733
   5. Hunting with a Gun 733
6. Carrying a Gun for Protection
   a. At Home or in One’s Place of Business
   b. In One’s Automobile
   c. In Public Places
7. Open Carry Today
8. Using a Gun for Self-Defense

Appendix: The Right to Arms in State Constitutions

PART THREE
THE MODERN RIGHT TO ARMS

10. The Supreme Court Affirms an Individual Right to Arms

   A. The Supreme Court Affirms an Individual Right to Keep and Bear Arms Against Federal Infringement
      *District of Columbia v. Heller*
   B. The Supreme Court Incorporates the Right to Keep and Bear Arms Against the States
      *McDonald v. City of Chicago*
      Comment: Modes of Constitutional Interpretation and Second Amendment Models
      Exercise: Constitutional Drafting

11. Applying the Affirmed Right to Arms

   A. The Evolving Standard of Review
      *Heller v. District of Columbia (Heller II)*
      *Heller v. District of Columbia (Heller III)*
      *Murphy v. Guerrero*
   B. Public Firearm Carriage
         *Moore v. Madigan*
         *Woollard v. Gallagher*
         Exercise: In-State Concealed Carry
      2. Prohibited Places: Restrictions on Carrying in Particular Places or Circumstances
         *Bonidy v. United States Postal Service*
         Campus Carry
         Exercise: Campus Carry
C. Firearm Commerce: The Right to Buy and Sell
   Illinois Association of Firearms Retailers v. City of Chicago 1032
   Radich v. Guerrero 1043

D. Prohibited Persons: Disarming Individuals Considered Dangerous or Untrustworthy
   1. Convicted Criminals 1056
      United States v. Skoien 1056
      Wesson v. Town of Salisbury 1068
      Binderup v. Attorney General: As-Applied Challenges to the “Felon-in-Possession” Ban 1073
   2. Persons Under the Age of Twenty-One 1076
      National Rifle Association of America, Inc. v. Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms, and Explosives 1076
   3. Aliens 1093
      United States v. Huitron-Guizar 1093
   4. The Mentally Ill 1100
      Tyler v. Hillside Cty. Sheriff’s Dept. 1100

E. Restrictions on Particular Technology: “Assault Weapons” and Nonfirearm Weapons 1136
   1. “Assault Weapons” 1136
      N.Y. State Rifle & Pistol Ass’n, Inc. v. Cuomo 1137
      Friedman v. City of Highland Park 1153
      Friedman v. City of Highland Park 1166
      Exercise: Ammunition-Based Controls 1176
   2. Nonfirearm Arms 1180
      State v. DeCicco 1180
      Caetano v. Massachusetts 1194

F. Ancillary Regulations Governing Firearm Use, Possession, and Transfer 1201
      Commonwealth v. Runyan 1202
   2. Serial Number Requirements 1208
      United States v. Marzzarella 1208
   3. Firearm Training 1218
      Ezell v. City of Chicago 1218
      Ezell v. City of Chicago (Ezell II) 1239

Appendices: Concluding Exercises 1255
   1. Adapting the Right to Bear Arms to Local Circumstances 1255
   2. What Arms? 1256
   3. Tyranny Control 1256
      Silveira v. Lockyer 1258
12
Firearms Policy and Status: Race, Gender, Age, Disability, and Sexual Orientation

13
International Law

14
Comparative Law

15
In-Depth Explanation of Firearms and Ammunition

16
Early Second Amendment Influences

Table of Cases 1265
Table of Authorities 1279
Table of Statutes, Constitutions, and Regulations 1305
Index 1323